

Eid and Jumuah on the Same Day

Muaz Billoo

A situation that arises from time to time is the coinciding of Eid and Jumuah on the same day. The question is: if a person performs the Eid salah, will that suffice for the Jumuah salah of the same day?

The answer is that the Eid salah will **not** suffice one from the Jumuah salah. These are two distinct prayers. The Jumuah salah is *fard* (obligatory) upon healthy, free, pubescent, sane, males who are **city residents**¹ and can safely get to the prayer area.² This is based on the statement of Allah ﷻ,

“Oh you who believe: when the call for Salāh (prayer) is proclaimed on Friday, hasten for the remembrance of Allah, and leave off business. That is much better for you, if you know.”³

This ayah is explicitly clear that the Jumu'ah salah is an obligation.

The Eid salah is *wajib* (mandatory) upon the same people for whom jumuah salah is *fard*. That the Eid salah does not suffice one from the Jumuah salah is the view of Imams Abu Hanifah,⁴ Malik⁵ and al-Shafi.⁶

The reason why some have this question is due to a misunderstanding regarding a Hadith narrated by Zaid ibn Arqam ؓ and Abu Hurairah ؓ wherein it is narrated that the Prophet ﷺ gave a dispensation for those who attended the Eid salah that they would not have to perform the Jumuah salah on the same day.⁷

Firstly, the authenticity of both of these narrations is disputed due to the presence of unreliable or unknown narrators. In the chain of narration for the Hadith of Zaid ibn Arqam ؓ there is a narrator by the name Iyas ibn Abu Ramlah al-Shami. Hafiz ibn Hajar al-'Asqalani ؒ says that he is *majhul* (unknown),⁸ thus his narrations cannot be used for deriving legal rulings. As for the Hadith of Abu Hurairah ؓ, Sheikh Zahid al-Kawthari ؒ points out a number of issues with its authenticity in his *Maqalat* pg. 133. How can we repeal the ayah of the Qur'an with questionable narrations?

¹ See: *al-Asl* 1:299

² See: *Hashiyah ibn 'Abidin* 5:54-60

³ Quran 62:9

⁴ See: *al-Jami' al-Saghir* pg. 78

⁵ See: *al-Mudawwanah al-Kubra* 1:237

⁶ See: *Kitab al-Umm* 2:516

⁷ *Sunan Abu Dawud* 1070 and 1073

⁸ *Taqrib al-Tahdhib* 587

Secondly, if we were to assume these narrations to be authentic, the next question would be: whom is the Prophet ﷺ directing this dispensation towards?

Imam al-Bukhari narrates that Abu ‘Ubaid, a Tabi’ee, says, “I attended the ‘Eid salah with ‘Uthman ibn ‘Affan. He prayed, then turned around and delivered the *khutbah*, whereupon he said, ‘On this day of yours, two holidays have gathered (Eid and Jumuah). Whoever would like to wait for the Jumuah salah from the people of the **villages**, then let him wait for it. Whoever would like to return, may return, for I have allowed it.’”⁹

This shows that the dispensation is for **villagers**, for whom both the Jumu’ah and Eid salahs are not required in the first place. They were allowed to go back to their villages because they were not required to perform the jumu’ah salah in the first place.

Imam Muhammad ibn al-Hasan al-Shaibani ؒ comments after quoting this narration, “We adhere to all of this. ‘Uthman ؓ specifically granted a dispensation for the villagers **because they were not residents of the city**, and this is the view of Imam Abu Hanifah.”¹⁰

The esteemed scholar of the Maliki school, Hafiz ibn Abdul Barr ؒ writes, “The best explanation given is that the dispensation granted was for those upon whom Jumu’ah was not even mandatory (in the first place).”¹¹

Imam al-Shafi’ ؒ writes, “When the day of Eid al-Fitr coincides with the day of Jumu’ah, the Imam will lead the Eid salah when the time comes in, then he will grant permission for the **non-city residents** to return to their families if they wish without coming back for Jumu’ah...this is not permissible for anyone from the city residents i.e. leaving the Jumu’ah salah, unless due to such an excuse which would allow them to leave the Jumu’ah salah, even if it is the day of Eid.”¹²

Imam al-Shafi’ even quotes the following Hadith, attributing it to the Prophet ﷺ, “Whoever wishes to sit from the people of the villages, then let him sit without any burden.” In this Hadith, the villagers have again been highlighted.

If it is said that this narration is questionable in its attribution to the Prophet ﷺ, we would say that the narrations quoted earlier which are used to argue that the Eid salah will suffice one from the Jumu’ah salah are also questionable. Furthermore, the narration quoted by Imam al-Shafi’ is supported by the statement of ‘Uthman ibn ‘Affan ؓ, who was from the *Khulafa Rashidin* (Rightly Guided Successors). The Prophet ﷺ said, “You must adhere to my Sunnah, and the Sunnah of my rightly guided successors after me; bite down onto it (the Sunnah) with the molar

⁹ *Sahih al-Bukhari* 5571 as well as *Muwatta Malik* through the recensions of Imam Muhammad (232), Yahya ibn Yahya al-Laithi (441), Yahya ibn Bukair (578), and Abu Mus’ab al-Zuhri (512). Imam al-Shafi’ also narrates this from Imam Malik in his *Kitab al-Umm* 555.

¹⁰ *Muwatta Muhammad* after Hadith #233

¹¹ *Al-Tamhid* 7:118

¹² *Kitab al-Umm* 2:516

teeth.”¹³ Thus we find that this dispensation is not for all Muslims, but just for a specific group (i.e. villagers).

Additionally, the narrations quoted earlier (to suggest that the Eid salah absolves one from the Jumuaah salah) state that although the Prophet ﷺ gave a dispensation, he still announced that he and the residents of Madinah would perform Jumu’ah on that day. A narration in *Sahih Muslim* #878 clearly shows that the Prophet ﷺ would perform the Jumu’ah salah even after performing the Eid salah earlier in the day. Is it not better to follow the Prophet’s ﷺ example?

Lastly, we find no example in the Shariah wherein the performance of a *wajib* or *sunnah* act absolves one of a separate *fard* act. It lacks any foundation or basis in Islamic law.

With these points in mind, we encourage the Muslims to not miss the Jumu’ah salah. It should still be performed. Recall that the Prophet ﷺ said,

“Whoever abandons the Jumu’ah salah three times without a valid excuse, Allah will seal his heart.”¹⁴

Note: A “city” in Islamic law can be defined as one wherein there is law enforcement such as through a governor/mayor, court judges, etc. A “village” according to Islamic law is one that lacks these things. Therefore, the majority of areas in the United States designated as “villages” will not be considered villages in Islamic law but will be classified as cities. For example, Greenwich Village is a neighborhood in Lower Manhattan. Although it is called a “village” it will fall under the classification of a city.¹⁵

والله أعلم

¹³ *Musnad Ahmad* 17145; authenticated by Imam al-Tirmidhi.

¹⁴ *Musnad Ahmad* 15498, *Sunan Abu Dawud* 1052, *Tirmidhi* 509; declared *Hasan* by Imam al-Tirmidhi.

¹⁵ See: *Hashiyah ibn ‘Abidin* 5:6-7